

October 29, 2018

Mary Nichols
Chair, California Air Resources Board
1001 I Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

We, the undersigned organizations, urge the California Air Resources Board to reject consideration of the Tropical Forest Standard (TFS), which would lay the groundwork for accepting Reduced Emissions from Deforestation and Degradation (REDD) offset credits into California's carbon trading system.

Preservation of tropical forests is critical for conserving biodiversity; providing homes, cultural resources, and livelihoods for millions of people; and for protecting our global climate. But the TFS proposed by the California Air Resources Board is deeply misguided, would undermine the integrity of California's climate policies, and cause or perpetuate human rights abuses.

Carbon offsets perpetuate pollution

Opening the floodgates to tropical forest offsets encourages polluters to avoid reducing their emissions. At best, offsets create *zero* emissions reductions. Under California's carbon trading system, it actually enables an increase in industrial emissions by a far greater amount than otherwise allowed by AB32, California's landmark climate change law. This has significant health impacts for fence-line communities in California – the majority of whom are people of color -- who live near major greenhouse gas (GHG) emitters. When refineries and other facilities are allowed to continue emitting greenhouse gases, they also emit noxious co-pollutants, like particulate matter, nitrogen oxide, and other carcinogens. Thus, carbon offsets perpetuate pollution hotspots and environmental racism, which should be of grave concern to the ARB as an air pollution regulator.

Tropical forest carbon offsets pose risks to Indigenous Peoples and human rights

The Tropical Forest Standard has been created as a preliminary step to allowing REDD carbon offset credits into California's carbon trading system. REDD projects have a well-known and recorded history of contributing to illegal actions, violence, forced decision-making, land grabs, and other human rights abuses for many Indigenous groups and forest-dwelling people around the globe. Notably, these negative impacts tend to be associated with jurisdictions with weak governance, unclear land tenure laws, and political instability – characteristics common among many of California's potential partner jurisdictions, including in Brazil, Nigeria, and Indonesia. Although the TFS tries to address these concerns, ultimately REDD projects sow division amongst Indigenous Peoples in a context of intimidation, coercion, and grossly disproportionate economic power exerted by governments and corporations. It is practically impossible for ARB to monitor international forest offset programs in foreign jurisdictions to prevent these abuses and ensure compliance with the TFS's human rights standards.

Tropical forest conservation projects are not suited for carbon offset credits

While many problems exist with offsets in general, there are significant issues unique to REDD projects that make them broadly unfit to offset industrial emissions. Many of these problems are outlined, although not adequately addressed, in the TFS's environmental impact assessment, including the problems of permanence and non-additionality. Simply put, tropical forest carbon offsets allow *certain, permanent* harm (the emission of more GHGs from industrial sources) in exchange for hoped-for, *uncertain, temporary* carbon sequestration. Because these problems are so intractable, no

jurisdiction in the world accepts REDD credits into its compliance market. Accepting REDD carbon offset credits would not only undermine the integrity of California's climate policy, but it would violate AB32's requirement that all emissions reductions be "real, additional, quantifiable, permanent, verifiable and enforceable."

Because of the reasons stated above, we strongly urge the ARB to reject consideration of the Tropical Forest Standard (TFS), and any attempts to accept REDD credits into California's carbon trading system.

If you have any questions, please contact Michelle Chan at mchan@foe.org.

Sincerely,

Acción Ecológica, Ecuador
AfrosRD, Dominican Republic
All India Forum of Forest Movements, India
Amigos de la Tierra, Spain
Amigos de la Tierra Argentina
ARA, Germany
Asia Pacific Forum on Women, Law and Development, Thailand
Associação 11 de Junho, Brazil
Association Nigérienne des Scouts de l'Environnement (ANSEN), Niger
Biofuelwatch, International
California Communities Against Toxics, United States
Censat Agua Viva- Amigos de la Tierra Colombia
Center for Environment/Friends of the Earth Bosnia and Herzegovina
Center for Sustainable Economy, United States
CESTA, Amigos de la Tierra El Salvador
Colectivo Sumaj Kawsay- Equipo de Investigación Ecología Política del Sur, Argentina
Companhia de Jesus, Brazil
Friends of the Earth Canada
Friends of the Earth England, Wales and Northern Ireland, United Kingdom
Friends of the Earth Finland
Friends of the Earth Ghana
Friends of the Earth International
Friends of the Earth Spain
Friends of the Earth U.S.
Global Forest Coalition, International
Green Delaware, United States
groundWork, South Africa
Heinrich Boell Stiftung North America
Indian Social Action Forum – INSAF, India
Institute for Agriculture and Trade Policy, United States
Justiça Ambiental/Friends of the Earth Mozambique
Les Amis de la Terre - Togo
Local Clean Energy Alliance, United States
Milieudefensie- Friends of the Earth Netherlands
New York Climate Action Group, United States
NGO Forum on ADB, Philippines

No REDD in Africa Network (NRAN), Africa-wide
NOAH/Friends of the Earth Denmark
Otros Mundos A.C., Mexico
Passionist Center for Justice Peace and Integrity of Creation (PC-JPIC), Philippines
Pastoral de la Tierra del Vicariato Apostólico de Yurimaguas, Perú
Rainforest Action Network, United States
Rainforest Resource and Development Centre (RRDC), Nigeria
Re:Common, Italy
Seventh Generation Fund for Indigenous Peoples, United States
Social Development Integrated Centre (Social Action), Nigeria
Texas Drought Project, United States
The Corner House, United Kingdom
Third World Network, Malaysia
TierrActiva, Peru
WRM - World Rainforest Movement, Uruguay
Youths and Environmental Advocacy Centre (YEAC), Nigeria

cc:

Diane Takvorian
Dean Florez
Hector de la Torre
John Gioia
Dr. John Balmes
Dr. Alex Sherriffs
Assembly Member Eduardo Garcia
Katie Valenzuela Garcia
Senator Ricardo Lara
Mike Peterson
Phil Serna
Lisa Nava
Judy Mitchell
Sandra Berg
Daniel Sperling
Barbara Riordan
Ron Roberts
John Eisenhut
Richard Corey
Veronica Eady
Jason Gray
Catalina Hayes-Bautista
Saul Gomez
Alice Reynolds
Senate President Pro Tempore, Toni Atkins
Kip Lipper
Assembly Speaker, Anthony Rendon
Marie Liu
Carrie Cornwell
Assembly Member Eduardo Garcia

Assembly Member Autumn Burke
Assembly Member Jim Frazier
Senator Henry I. Stern
Senator Ben Hueso
Senator Nancy Skinner
CalEPA Secretary, Matthew Rodriguez
CalEPA EJ Officer, Yana Garcia
Attorney General's Office EJ team, Arsenio Mataka