July 19, 2022

The Honorable Michael Regan Administrator U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Mail code 1101A Washington, DC 20460

Dear Administrator Regan:

On behalf of the undersigned organizations and our millions of U.S. members and supporters, we are writing to urge the Environmental Protection Agency to exercise its existing statutory authority to protect communities from the harmful impacts of concentrated animal feeding operations (CAFOs), also known as factory farms.

In January 2021, President Biden signed Executive Orders on Tackling the Climate Crisis at Home and Abroad¹ and on Advancing Racial Equity and Support for Underserved Communities Through the Federal Government,² which establish environmental justice and racial equity as Administration priorities. In EPA's 2022-2026 Strategic Plan, the agency confirmed its commitment to "follow the science, follow the law, and be transparent" and added "a fourth foundational principle: advance justice and equity" as the basis for the Agency's culture and approach to its operations and decision-making.³ We commend these commitments but contend that the EPA is failing to uphold them by abdicating its responsibility to protect rural communities living near CAFOs.

Multinational agribusiness has been vertically and horizontally integrating the meat production supply chain for the past several decades, leading to massive growth of CAFOs.⁴ These heavily polluting operations produce immense quantities of waste and pollutants that degrade community air and water resources and destroy the quality of life for the communities where they are deliberately located, ⁵ which are disproportionately low-wealth and/or communities of color.⁶ CAFOs represent an environmental justice crisis that has gone unaddressed by – and has even been exacerbated by – EPA for decades.

In the U.S., CAFOs generate as much as one billion tons of manure each year, more than three times as much waste as humans.⁷ The waste, which is often stored in giant manure pits and periodically applied to spray fields, can contain pathogens, antibiotic-resistant bacteria, and heavy metals,⁸ leading to death, and poor general health.⁹

Odor plumes from CAFOs, which often pervade nearby communities, contain respiratory and eye irritants including hydrogen sulfide and ammonia.¹⁰ Both substances are associated with a variety of respiratory issues at certain levels, and studies have found consistent correlations between communities' proximity to CAFOs and asthma, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, and other serious health issues.¹¹ One study published in 2021 found approximately 12,700 deaths per year from air pollution in the U.S. are attributable to industrial livestock production.¹² That is more deaths than occur from pollution from coal plants, yet EPA has largely shielded industrial livestock integrators and their web of CAFOs from oversight.

Through its AgSTAR program, EPA has supported CAFOs with installing methane digesters, which have failed to curb or, in some cases, exacerbated these air and water co-pollutants and associated adverse public health impacts for communities.¹³ Methane digesters only serve to further entrench the destructive factory farming model and marry it with the fossil fuel industry. If EPA were to implement an electrification pathway for factory farmed methane gas produced by CAFOs under the Renewable Fuel Standard, this new subsidy would compound the suffering of rural communities from both CAFOs and fossil fuel infrastructure.

In addition to being a leading cause of water and air pollution, animal agriculture is a major contributor to greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions. Animal agriculture is the top source of U.S. methane emissions, according to EPA's own data. Climate change disproportionately affects communities of color, low-income communities, and other vulnerable populations, which are more likely to live in isolated rural areas, floodplains, coastlines, and other at-risk locations, making them at risk of exposure to adverse climate change impacts. Sadly, these same communities continue to be saturated with hazardous pollution discharged and emitted from industrial livestock operations, compounding the harm inflicted.

Not only do CAFOs lack resilience in the face of extreme weather, but they also present a major public health and environmental hazard during increasing extreme weather events because of the amount of waste they produce. When there is an infrastructure failure or heavy rain storm, manure lagoons can spill decades' worth of accumulated waste onto local properties, causing crop destruction, soil degradation, water contamination, and other adverse impacts. Communities of color are disproportionately exposed to the harmful pathogens, contaminated drinking water, and antibiotic-resistance bacteria associated with CAFOs and have fewer resources to overcome the damage.

Your home state of North Carolina is perhaps the most poignant example of the environmental racism associated with this industry and the devastation to communities of color caused by a lack of federal oversight. Naeema Muhammad, a long-time organizer with the North Carolina Environmental Justice Network, explains it best:

These pigs are producing about 19 million tons of animal waste on an annual basis. It's going into our rivers and streams. It sits out in the air openly until they decide to irrigate it. They irrigate this waste out around the fields and crops. They call it organic fertilizer and say that there was no harm to it. But the problem is that it has all kinds of toxic chemicals. Hydrogen sulfide comes off the lagoons and it's making people in the community sick. As an organizer, I've been working with these communities since the early 2000s. People say they get sick, nauseated, you get headaches, and you get angry and frustrated living like that. People don't go outside anymore.

Many of our bedrock environmental protection laws—such as the Clean Air Act, the Clean Water Act, and the Emergency Planning and Community Right-to-Know Act— already authorize EPA to oversee emissions and discharges from CAFOs, but EPA has consistently exempted animal agriculture from standards meant to protect communities from industrial pollution. Congress has granted the EPA authority to protect the public from harmful pollution, ¹⁹ and the agency has several regulatory petitions before it that lay out pathways to exercise this authority. We urge EPA to end the regulatory exceptionalism and hold accountable the industrial livestock agribusinesses profiting from the exploitation of environmental justice communities.

Respectfully,

CatholicNetwork US

350 Eugene CO Businesses for a Livable Climate

350Brooklyn Coming Clean

50by40 Compassion in World Farming

A Stone's Throw B&B Compassionate Bay

A Well-Fed World Community And Family AID Foundation
Accelerate Neighborhood Climate Action Community for Sustainable Energy

Acterra Corporate Accountability

AFGE Local 3354 Cultivate Charlottesville

Alliance of Nurses for Healthy Environments Cultivate Kansas City

Alliance of Nurses for Healthy Environments Cultivate Kansas City
American Friends Service Committee Dakota Rural Action

American Indian Mothers Inc. Don't Gas the Meadowlands Coalition

American Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Dorchester Unified Neighborhood Association

(ASPCA) Earth Ethics, Inc.

Animals Are Sentient Beings, Inc.

Arkansas Ozark Waterkeeper

Assateague Coastal Trust

Beyond Pesticides

Earth Guardians

Earthjustice

Eat for the Earth

EcoPoetry.org

Black VegFest Endangered Species Coalition

Bold Alliance Environmental Justice Team, Cedar Lane UU Church

Farm Aid

Boone County Food Council Environmental Working Group

Brighter Green Extinction Rebellion San Francisco Bay Area

Buffalo River Watershed Alliance Factory Farming Awareness Coalition

Butte County Local Food Network Fair Start Movement
Call to Action Colorado Fair World Project

Campaign for Family Farms and the Environment Family Farm Defenders
Cape Fear River Watch Farm Action

Cedar Lane Environmental Justice Ministry Farm Forward

Center for Biological Diversity Farmworker Association of Florida
Center for Environmental Health Food Animal Concerns Trust

Center for Food Safety Food & Water Watch

Chicago Food Policy Action Council Food Freedom Radio - AM950

Chilis on Wheels The Foodshed Network

Church Women United in New York State Fox Valley Citizens for Peace & Justice

Citizen's Alliance for a Sustainable Englewood Friends of the Earth
Clean Water for NC Gladney Farm

CleanAirNow Global Forest Coalition

Climate 911 Global Justice Ecology Project

Climate Justice Alliance GMOSCIENCE

Coalition of Community Organizations GMO/Toxin Free USA

Government Accountability Project Food Integrity Campaign Mangrove Action Project
Greater New Orleans Housing Alliance March of Silence NYC
The Green House Connection Center The Marion Institute

Green America Massachusetts Avenue Project

Green Latinos Mayfair Park Neighborhood Association Board

Green State Solutions Mercy For Animals

Green Village Communications Mental Health & Inclusion Ministries

Greenbelt Climate Action Network Michigan Organic Food and Farm Alliance

Greenpeace USA Mid-Missouri Peaceworks
Growing Healthy Kids, Inc Milwaukee Riverkeeper

The Growing Project Missouri Coalition for the Environment

GROW North Texas MLC Climate Justice Wing

Gulf Coast Center for Law & Policy Montbello Neighborhood Association Board

Harvard School of Law & Policy Clinic MOSA Certified Organic
Hawai'i Alliance for Progressive Action (HAPA) Mothers Out Front Colorado

Hawai'i SEED Movement Rights
HEAL Food Alliance National Farm to S

HEAL Food Alliance National Farm to School Network
Health Care Without Harm National Farm Worker Ministry

Hempstead Project Heart National Latino Farmers & Ranchers Trade Association

Herbicide-Free Campus NC Clinicians for Climate Action

Honor the Earth New Entry Sustainable Farming Project

Humane Society Legislative Fund The Non-GMO Project

Humane Society of the United States North American Climate, Conservation and Environment

Humane Society Veterinary Medical Association (NACCE)

Hungry Planet North Carolina Conservation Network

I-70 Citizens Advisory Group

North Carolina Environmental Justice Network
Indivisible Ambassadors

Northeast Organic Dairy Producers Alliance

Infinite Agriculture Northeast Organic Farming Association-Interstate Council

Institute for Agriculture and Trade Policy North Range Concerned Citizens

Interfaith EarthKeepers Novasutras

International Center for Technology Assessment NWI Food Council

Iowa Citizens for Community Improvement NYCLASS (New Yorkers for Safe, Livable and Safe Streets)

Jefferson County Farmers & Neighbors, Inc.

Ohio Ecological Food and Farm Association

Johns Hopkins Center for a Livable Future

Open Markets Institute

Ophelia's Blue Vine Farm

Kitchen Sync Strategies OrganicEye

Land Stewardship Project People for a Healthy Environment

Larimer Alliance for Health, Safety and Environment Pesticide Action Network

LEAD for Pollinators, Inc. Physicians Against Red Meat (PhARM)

The Livestock Institute of Southern New England, Inc.

Planetary Health Collective
Plant Based Foods Institute
Lower East Side Ecology Center

PlantPure Communities

Pollinate Minnesota Sonoma Hot Sauce
ProVeg International Soul Fire Farm Institute

Public Justice Southwest Organization for Sustainability

Rachel Carson Council Spirit of the Sun, Inc.

RapidShift Network Stop the Algonquin Pipeline Expansion

The Raven Corps Stray Dog Institute
Reach Out America Sunrise Movement

Real Food Media System Change Not Climate Change

Real Organic Project Terra Advocati
Reducetarian Foundation They Keep Bees

Resource Renewal Institute TIAA-Divest! from Climate Destruction

Rhode Island Food Policy Council Toxic Free North Carolina
River Guardian Foundation Transformations CDC
Rural Advancement Foundation International - USA True Health Initiative
Rural Coalition Unite North Metro Denver

Rural Development Leadership Network Vegan Activist Alliance

RuralOrganizing.org Education Fund Verde Valley Food Policy Council

San Francisco Bay Physicians for Social Responsibility Vermont Law School Environmental Justice Clinic

Santa Cruz Climate Action Network

Save EPA

Vilicus Farms

Wall of Women

Save Our Illinois Land Waterkeeper Alliance
Seneca Lake Guardian Waterway Advocates

Sierra Club WESPAC Foundation, Inc.

Sisters of Charity Federation West End Revitalization Association WERA
Sisters of St. Dominic of Blauvelt, New York Western Slope Businesses for a Livable Climate

Slow Food USA West Virginia Environmental Council

Small Business Alliance Women, Food and Agriculture Network (WFAN)

Socially Responsible Agriculture Project Working for Racial Equity

¹ White House, Executive Order on Tackling the Climate Crisis at Home and Abroad (Jan. 27, 2021), available at https://www.whitehouse.gov/briefing-room/presidential-actions/2021/01/27/executive-order-on-tackling-the-climate-crisis-at-home-and-abroad/

² The White House, Executive Order13985, Advancing Racial Equity and Support for Underserved Communities through the Federal Government (Jan. 20, 2021), available at https://www.whitehouse.gov/briefing-room/presidential-actions/2021/01/20/executive-order-advancing-racial-equity-and-support-for-underserved-communities-through-the-federal-government/.

³ Environmental Protection Agency, Draft FY 2022-2026 EPA Strategic Plan (Oct. 1, 2021) 4, available at https://www.epa.gov/system/files/documents/2021-10/fy-2022-2026-epa-draft-strategic-plan.pdf.

⁴ Sharma S, Institute for Agriculture and Trade Policy, Mighty Giants: Leaders of the Global Meat Complex (Apr. 10, 2018) available at https://www.iatp.org/blog/leaders-global-meat-complex.

⁵ Hribar, C., Understanding Concentrated Animal Feeding Operations and Their Impact on Communities, National Ass'n of Local Boards of Health (2010) 3, available at https://www.cdc.gov/nceh/ehs/docs/understanding cafos nalboh.pdf.

https://cfpub.epa.gov/si/si_public_record_report.cfm?Lab=NRMRL&dirEntryId=148645

- ¹³ Conservation Practice Standard, Anaerobic Digester, Code 366, U.S. Dep't Agriculture, Nat. Res. Conservation Serv., 366-CPS-6, (June 2017) ("USDA Conservation Practice Standard"), available at https://www.nrcs.usda.gov/Internet/FSE DOCUMENTS/stelprdb1254996.pdf ("Compounds such as nitrogen, phosphorus
- and other elements become more soluble due to anaerobic digestion and therefore have higher potential to move with water".); See See Jennifer K. Costanza et al., Potential geographic distribution of atmospheric nitrogen deposition from intensive livestock production in North Carolina, USA (2008) available at

http://jencostanza.com/docs/Costanza_et_al_2008_STOTEN.pdf (noting the significant amount of ammonia deposition accounting for new nitrogen inputs into the coastal ecosystem).

see also Lowry A. Harper et al, The Effect of Biofuel Production on Swine Farm Methane and Ammonia Emissions (2010), available at https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/21284295/ (finding a 46 percent increase in ammonia emissions from mesophilic biogas digester relative to control lagoons).

- ¹⁴ Koneswaran, G., & Nierenberg, D., Global farm animal production and global warming: impacting and mitigating climate change (Jan. 2008) available at https://doi.org/10.1289/ehp.11034.
- ¹⁵ EPA, Overview of Greenhouse Gases, Methane. Available at https://www.epa.gov/ghgemissions/overview-greenhouse-gases#methane.
- ¹⁶ USGCRP, Impacts of Climate Change on Human Health in the United States, 249 (2016); California's Fourth Climate Change Assessment, Climate Justice Summary Report 36-48 (2018), available at https://health2016.globalchange.gov/low/ClimateHealth2016 FullReport small.pdf
- ¹⁷ Hribar, supra note 5 at 4.
- ¹⁸ See, e.g., Press Release: NC Dep't of Envtl. Quality, Division of Water Resources Issues Notice of Violation to B&L Farms (Jul. 16, 2020) (hog lagoon breach caused three million gallons of manure to spread "into farms, wetlands, and . . . tributary"), available at https://deq.nc.gov/news/press-releases/2020/07/16/division-water-resources-issues-notice-violation-bl-farms; Eight Manure Lagoons Overflow in Western Iowa Because of Flooding, SIOUX CITY J. (Mar. 26, 2019), available at https://siouxcityjournal.com/news/state-and-regional/iowa/eight-manure-lagoons-overflow-in-western-iowa-because-of-flooding/article_792b6561-c617-58ea-b287-70c58d3bb2bc.html; Wynne Davis, Overflowing Hog Lagoons Raise Environmental Concerns in North Carolina, NPR (Sep. 22, 2018),

https://www.npr.org/2018/09/22/650698240/hurricane-s-aftermath-floods-hog-lagoons-in-north-carolina.

¹⁹ See 42 U.S.C. 7401(c), (stating that "a primary goal of this subchapter is to encourage or otherwise promote reasonable Federal, State, and local governmental actions. . .for pollution prevention."); See also Environmental Protection Agency, Clean Water Act and Federal Facilities, Summary, available at https://www.epa.gov/enforcement/clean-water-act-cwa-and-federal-

facilities#:~:text=Federal%20facilities%20have%20regulatory%20responsibilities,meeting%20applicable%20water%20qualit y%20standards, (providing "[t]he CWA aims to prevent, reduce, and eliminate pollution in the nation's water in order to 'restore and maintain the chemical, physical, and biological integrity of the Nation's waters,' as described in CWA section 101(a). ")

⁶ Oliva E, Yale Scientific, Environmental Justice and Industrial Animal Farms (June 20, 2021), available at https://www.yalescientific.org/2021/06/environmental-justice-and-industrial-animal-farms/#:~:text=According%20to%20a%20recent%20study,of%20color%20and%20impoverished%20communities.

⁷ Environmental Protection Agency, Detecting and mitigating the environmental impact of fecal pathogens originating from confined animal feeding operations: Review (2005) 1, available at

⁸ Hribar, supra note 5, at 2.

⁹Grout, L. et. Al, A Review of Potential Public Health Impacts Associated With the Global Dairy Sector (Jan. 3, 2020) 4.2.3. Chemical Pollutants. Available at https://doi.org/10.1029/2019GH000213.

¹⁰ Nicole, W., CAFOS and Environmental Justice: The Case of North Carolina (2013) Environmental Health Perspectives, available at https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3672924/.

¹¹ Casey JA, Kim BF, Larsen J, Price LB, Nachman KE. Industrial Food Animal Production and Community Health. (Sept. 2015), available at https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/26231503.

¹² Domingo, N.G., et. al., Air quality-related Health Damages of Food (2021), available at https://www.pnas.org/doi/10.1073/pnas.2013637118.